

# Using engaging question to stimulate critical study & to better understand Chumash & the Parshanim

sources for ATT Chicago conference /shiur by Menachem Leibtag –

## Intro. Discuss – Chumash – a book to 'read' or 'study'

Example from the study of Moshe's 'sin' at mei meriva Bamidbar 20:1-14

Opening questions - to engage conversation - and interest [examples...]

Read 20:7-8

Count how many commandments Moshe Rabeinu was given by God.

Ask the students, how you would have expected Moshe to fulfill them!

Then read 20:9-12 - Did Moshe do what you expected?

[Try to read both as 'prosecutor' and as 'defense attorney' ]

Then study the punishment, & discuss if it makes sense, or was too harsh

## A. The Crime Scene: - *what did Moshe & Aharon do wrong?*

*The COMMAND (pasuk 8)*

קח את־המטה וְהִקְהַל אֶת־הָעֵדָה אֹתָהּ וְאָהֲרֹן אֶחָיִךְ  
וְדַבַּרְתֶּם אֶל־הַסֵּלַע לְעִינֵיהֶם וְנָתַן מִיָּמָיו וְהוֹצֵאתָ לָהֶם מַיִם מִן־הַסֵּלַע  
וְהִשְׁקִיתָ אֶת־הָעֵדָה וְאֶת־בְּעִירָם :

*ITS EXECUTION (psukim 9-11)*

1. וַיִּקַּח מֹשֶׁה אֶת־הַמֶּטֶה מִלִּפְנֵי ה' - כַּאֲשֶׁר צִוְּהוּ :
2. וַיִּקְהַל מֹשֶׁה וְאָהֲרֹן אֶת־הַקְּהָל אֶל־פְּנֵי הַסֵּלַע
3. וַיֹּאמְרוּ לָהֶם שְׂמְעוּנָא הַמִּרְיָם הַמִּוֹהַסֵּלַע הַזֶּה נּוֹצֵיא לָכֶם מַיִם?
4. וַיִּרְם מֹשֶׁה אֶת־יָדוֹ וַיַּךְ אֶת הַסֵּלַע בְּמִטְהוֹ פַּעַמַּיִם וַיִּצְאוּ מַיִם רַבִּים.
5. וַתִּשֶׁת הָעֵדָה וּבְעִירָם :

## B. The Punishment:

יב וַיֹּאמֶר ה' אֶל־מֹשֶׁה וְאֶל־אֶהֲרֹן יַעַן לֹא־הֵאֱמַנְתֶּם בִּי לְהַקְדִּישֵׁנִי לְעֵינֵי בְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל -  
לְכֹן לֹא תָבִיאוּ אֶת־הַקְּהָל הַזֶּה אֶל־הָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר־נָתַתִּי לָהֶם :  
יג הִמָּה מִי מְרִיבָה אֲשֶׁר־דָּבּוּ בְנֵי־יִשְׂרָאֵל אֹתִי וַיִּקְדַּשׁ בָּם :

## C. The Hebrew word "emunah" - see Shmot 17:12

יב וַיְדַי מֹשֶׁה כְּבָדִים, וַיִּקְחוּ־אָבּוֹ וַיִּשְׂימוּ תַחְתּוֹ וַיִּשָּׁב עָלֶיהָ ;  
וְאֶהֲרֹן וְחֹוֹר תִּמְכוּ בְיָדָיו, מְזֶה אֶחָד וּמְזֶה אֶחָד, וַיְהִי יָדָיו אֱמוּנָה, עַד־בֹּא הַשָּׁמֶשׁ.

וַיְהִי אֱמֹן אֶת־הַדָּסָה, הִיא אֶסְתֵּר בֵּת־דָּדוֹ--כִּי אִין לָהּ, אָב וְאָם See also Esther 2:7

## D. God's solution to stop the complaints in Parshat Korach [test of the matot]

כה וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֶל־מֹשֶׁה הִשָּׁב אֶת־מִטְהָ אֶהֲרֹן לִפְנֵי הָעֵדוּת לְמִשְׁמַרְתָּ לְאוֹת  
לְבְנֵי־מִרְי וְתַכַּל תִּלּוּנְתֶם מֵעָלַי וְלֹא יָמָתוּ  
כו וַיַּעַשׂ מֹשֶׁה כַּאֲשֶׁר צִוְּהוּ ה' אֹתוֹ כֹּן עָשָׂה :  
כז וַיֹּאמְרוּ בְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל אֶל־מֹשֶׁה לֵאמֹר הֵן גּוֹעַנּוּ אֲבָדָנוּ כְּלָנוּ אֲבָדָנוּ :

Now read 20:1-6 to attempt to identify a 'leadership issue'

## Sefer Bamidbar - What 'belongs' & what doesn't!

Chapter	Ongoing Narrative	Mitzvot l'dorot ( <i>Commandments</i> )
**	<b><i>Preparing to leave Har Sinai</i></b>	
1->4	Organizing the camp, army etc.	
5		Laws of "asham" * "sotah"
6		Laws of "nazir" & birkat kohanim
7	Dedication of Mishkan by the Nsiim	
8	Ceremony for Leviim, replacing bchorim	
9	Pesach in the desert; instructions on how to travel following the 'anan'	[Pesach sheni/ reason for delay?]
10	Using the "chatzrotot" for travel signals; Travel begins on 20 Iyar; "va'yhi b'nsoa"	
**	<b><i>Failure of first generation</i></b>	
11	<b>Sin</b> of the "mitavim"; 70 elders appointed	
12	<b>Sin</b> of Miriam, talking against Moshe	
13-14	<b>Sin</b> of the spies; & the "maapilim"	
15		Laws re: korbanot, taking challa, Sanhedrin, shabbat, & tzizit
16-17	Korach's <b>rebellion</b> ; test of the 12 staffs	
18		Laws re: Compensation for shevet Levi
19		Laws re: 'para aduma' / "tumat meyt"
20	Moshe & Aharon's <b>sin</b> at Mei Meriva; Fortieth year/ journey around Har Seir	
21	War with Arad; <b>sin</b> of "nachash nchoshet" War with Sichon/ Conquer of Transjordan	
22-24	Story of Bilam & Balak	
25	<b>Sin</b> of Bnei Yisrael with 'bnot Moav'; revenge taken by Pinchas etc.	
**	<b><i>Preparing to Enter Canaan</i></b>	
26	Census, who will inherit the land	
27	Daughters of Tzlofchad request 'nachala'; Moshe is told to die, Yehoshua appointed	
28-29		Laws of Tmidim u'Musafim (holidays)
30		Laws re: annulling vows
31	War against Midyan	
32	Inheritance taken by Reuven, Gad & Menashe; & their promise to fight....	
33	Summary of Travel thru the desert	[ <i>Commandment to conquer the land?</i> ]
34	Borders of Eretz Cannan (to conquer)	
35	Cities of Levites & Cities of Refuge	
36	Bnot Tzlofchad - protecting inheritance	